

Verification Report

Control Union Bolivia S.A.
Calle Pedro Blanco #1344
Edificio Continental Piso 6, Oficina 6B,
COCHABAMBA
Bolivia



Project Name	Arbolivia
Project ID	Arbolivia
Province and Country	Beni, Cochabamba, La Paz – Bolivia
Project size	Project total area: 312.7 ha Efective Planted area: ha 312.7 ha
Project developer	<i>Sicirec Bolivia Ltda</i> Cochabamba, Bolivia represented by Mr Anko Arthur Stilma Phone :(+591-4)448.51.19 (+591) 769-71970 a.stilma@sicirec-bolivia.org
Assessment Team Leader	Mr. Gerben Stegeman
Internal Report ID	CUC2018ARBO002_V1_FG
Standard Version	2013
Type of Certification	Verification
Date of issuance: Final Report	Date: 14-May-2019
Valid until	Date: 23-October-2023
Validated CO₂-certificates (total 2018): ex-post: ex-ante:	75,309 tCO ₂ 38,122 tCO ₂ 37,187 tCO ₂
Buffer CO₂-certificates (Total 2018) ex-post ex-ante	12,017 tCO ₂ (10% PV buffer + 10% voluntary Arbolivia project). 9,530 tCO ₂ 2,487 tCO ₂

About the certification body

Assessment Team Leader	<p>Mr. Gerben Stegeman Tel: +591 4 4544819 gstegeman@controlunion.com</p> <p>Short summary on the CV from Mr. Gerben Stegeman: Tropical Forestry Engineer with 28 years of worldwide forest management experience, of which 12 year experience in FSC® forest management and chain of custody certification as auditor, reviewer, certification decision maker and program manager, and over 18 years of forest management experience in Bolivia.</p> <p>Signature:</p> 	In shorts GS
Assessment Team Member	<p>Mr. Flavio Guiera Tel: +55 41 992020103 fguiera@gmail.com</p> <p>Forest Engineer, Advisor of certification for quality and socio-environmental management systems. Qualified lead auditor IRCA. Fifteen years experienced in FSC® Forest Management and Chain of Custody certification in Brazil, Latin America and Southeast Asia. CUC Lead Auditor since 2009. Specialist in risk assessments and sustainability in the forest products supply chain. Worked for forest companies in the private sector, NGOs and governmental bodies.</p> <p>Signature:</p> 	In short FG

History of certification cycle reporting

1. Draft sent to project developer	25-Oct-2016
1. Feedback	27-Jan-2017 03-Feb-2017
2. Draft sent to project developer	09-feb-2017
2. Feedback	10-feb-2017
3. Draft sent to project developer	18-Mar-2017 (request on latest ex-ante and –post data calculation)
3. Feedback	05-04-2017
Date of issuance: Final Report	26-04-2017
4. Draft of performance verification	01-04-2019

1. INTRODUCTION

Objective

The objectives of the certification are the following:

- Assess conformance of new areas with the certification criteria as laid out in the Plan Vivo Standards (PV);
- Assess performance of the certification criteria as per already validated project area in the PV;
- Evaluate the conformance with the certification scope, including the GHG project and baseline scenarios,
- GHG sources, sinks, and reservoirs; and the physical infrastructure, activities, technologies and processes of the GHG project to the requirements of the PV;
- Evaluate the calculation of GHG emissions, including the correctness and transparency of formula and factors used, assumptions related to estimating GHG emission reductions, and uncertainties;
- Determine whether the project could reasonably be expected to achieve the claimed GHG reduction/removals.

Scope

The project aims to evaluate the performance of ArBolivia Project to the Plan Vivo Standards and verify additional areas and new project members proposed for inclusion into total project area.

Additional project member will be included for this validation of certificates according to Plan Vivo 2013 Standards, with a total of 83.3 ha since last VVB audit.

The total project area encompasses now 312.7 ha.

Level of assurance

The verification was carried out in order to provide a reasonable level of assurance of conformance against the defined Plan Vivo standard requirements and materiality thresholds within the audit scope. Based on the findings of this verification, a positive statement assures that the project's PES (Payments for Ecosystem Services) assertion is materially correct and fairly represents the Technical Specification data and information.

Project description

Represented by SICIREC Bolivia Ltda, ArBolivia Project is part of the implementation and forest management of a carbon reforestation project with the aim of contributing to the mitigation of climate change and social risks in developing countries.

The ArBolivia Project together with local rural smallholders promotes rural and productive development through reforestation activities with mixed, mainly native tree species, sustainable forestry plantation management and the provision of environmental services. Specific silvicultural and forest management tasks are defined together with the farmer. The application of a poly-cyclic harvesting system aims to ensure a relatively high average carbon storing capacity in the plantations. Though the carbon calculations are based on a mono cyclic harvesting system applying a conservative approach.

The project is being implemented in settler areas in the Cochabamba Tropics, Northern La Paz, and Western Beni, spread by three focal regions as follows: zone of Beni/La Paz covering municipalities of Reyes, Rurrenabaque, San Borja y San Buenaventura; Zone of Cochabamba covering municipalities of Chimoré, Puerto Villaruel y Shinahota.

The settlers' areas have been a destination for migrants coming from the "High Valley" and Altiplano regions of Bolivia since the 1930s. Small holders own 95% of the land in the portfolio regions. The sizes of the properties vary, but they are on average 20 hectares per family in the Cochabamba Tropics, and 25 to 50 ha in the other regions. Only a few farmers have land less than 20 ha. The settlers are organized into syndicates of 20 to 60 farmer families. Approximately 5 syndicates form a "central", which in turn belongs to a federation.

Traditional land-use practices associated over-harvesting of native forests has led to widespread deforestation, which has led to a growing shortage of timber from commercial native species. This has spurred interest by small farmers in the conservation and sustainable management of the primary and secondary forests and in planting trees on their farmland.

Areas reforested represent only small portions of the holdings of farmers which they designate voluntarily for this purpose in consideration of their food security and livelihood needs. Special programs like Integrated Land Use Planning, Agroforestry systems and silvopastoral systems accompany the project in order to guarantee food and income security for the farmers involved.

The implementation as well as the maintenance activities necessary to ensure tree development within plantations are carried out by the farmers. The activities, e.g. weeding or pruning, are planned together with the project staff during the farm visits. During the visit a personalized on-farm capacity building assessment is realized by the technician to the farmer in order to assure accomplishment according to certain minimal technical standards and schedule.

List of species planted:

Tectona grandis, Teca

Virola flexuosa, Gabun

Terminalia oblonga, Verdolago amarrillo de ala

Terminalia amazonica, Verdolago negro de ala

Tapirira guianensis, Palo román

Stryphnodendron purpureum, Palo yugo

Schyzolobium amazonicum, Serebo

Guarea rusbyi, Trompillo de altura

Dipteryx odorata, Almendrillo

Centrolobium tomentosum, Tejeyeque

Calophyllum basilicense, Palo María

Buchenavia oxycarpa, Verdolago negro or Pepa

Aspidosperma macrocarpon, Jichituriqui

It was estimated that the project would generate around 61 thousand tCO2 in a 40 years crediting period. With the results of 10 years of collecting growing data from permanent plots, the new estimation has increased the expected amount of issuance to around 87.000 tCO2 in the 40 years cycle.

2. METHODOLOGY

The project approach consisted of the following steps:

Performance certification based on the delivered PDD, Annual Reports and supporting documentation

- Desk Review
- Site Visit
- Validation and Verifications assessment

Desk review

During the assessment Control Union reviewed the following elements of the project and verified compliance against the Plan Vivo Version 2013 Standard Requirements based on information provided by ArBolivia:

- Project Design Document (PDD);
- Annual Reports for Plan Vivo Certification;
- Shape files of the project (verification based on existing satellite images);
- Shape files of the new members of the project (verification based on existing satellite images);
- Review of the Technical Specification document;
- Review of the Methodology of Carbon Stock calculation and new prognostics data.

Site visit:

Site visit was combined for both the Gold Standard and the Plan Vivo performance verification. For sampling and calculation purposes, farms were strictly separated between both schemes.

Also a sample of different sites where Arbolivia Project is developing agroforestry systems (AFS) were visited, but those sites are still taken out of the scope, given that there are insufficient data collected to support the inclusion of its carbon stocks in the the project by now.

During the site visit the following elements were verified based on a further requirement to determine sampling:

- Field verification of the Project Coordination and Management;
- Field verification of Shape files and land management plans;
- Field verification of the Participatory Design;
- Field verification on the implementation of Sustainability Monitoring Plan;
- Field verification of Risk management;
- Field verification of the Livelihood Impacts;
- Field verification of the PES agreements and benefit-sharing;
- Consultation with local stakeholders.

Deliverables: Deliverable 2

- Audit planning
- Draft Report, including CARs and OBS.

3. CONCLUSION

The forest management system, procedures, and techniques of **ArBolivia Project** have been assessed by CUC according to the standards the Plan Vivo Standard Version. 2013.

In the opinion of the lead auditor, Flavio Guiera, ArBolivia Project (SICIREC) is in conformity with the certification requirements and operations should be continued.

4. SUMMARY OF ASSESSMENT

A non-conformance is defined as a deficiency, discrepancy or misrepresentation that in all probability materially affects carbon credit claims.

Major Corrective Action Request (Major CAR) – With a MAJOR CAR, Control Union Certifications requests appropriate action be taken to show compliance with a requirement.

In order to achieve a successful re-certification, all Major CARs shall be formally closed.

Major CARs can be converted to Minor CARs.

Minor Corrective Action Request (Minor CAR) - With a MINOR CAR, Control Union Certifications requests appropriate action be taken to become fully compliant with a requirement. A Minor CAR will be issued where the impact of the infraction is:

(a) not material within the current certification, AND

(b) unusual or non-systematic, AND

(c) correctable in a specific timeframe less than 5 years.

Observation (OBS) – With an OBS, Control Union Certifications provides an observation on possible future non-compliance with a requirement.

Unlike CARs, observations are warnings and do not need to be formally corrected. They are given special attention during the next certification.

For detailed findings please refer to Annex 1

Overview of OBS/FAR/CAR

Number	Date found	Reference	Status	Remarks	Date closed
CUC-FAR-01 (MINOR)	08/10/2016	2.3	OPEN	Deadline for closure 5 years from closing meeting (23 October 2023)	

CUC-FAR-02 (MINOR)	24/10/2018	5.3	OPEN	Deadline for closure 5 years from closing meeting (23 October 2023)	
CUC-OBS-01	08/10/2016	2.4.2	CLOSED		24 - October 2018
CUC-OBS-02	08/10/2016	3.14	CLOSED		21 December 2016
CUC-OBS-03	08/10/2016	5.18	OPEN		
CUC-OBS-04	24/10/2018	5.2	OPEN		

5. REVIEWED DOCUMENTS

The project provided the following documents for revision prior to the field verification.

PDD assessment	
Documents of Performance	
Carbon sequestration through reforestation and improved land use in the Bolivian tropics by smallholders - ArBolivia Project – Plan Vivo Project Development Document (PDD) – (April-2011)	
Sistema de Monitoreo y Evaluación del Proyecto ArBolivia – Reporte General (24-octubre-2018)	
Growth model based Permanent Sample Plots (Especies y datos de crecimiento)	
New Issuance Plan Vivo A/R Credits (Datos de las nuevas parcelas a certificar Oct-2018)	
List of Management Units (MUs) (Oct-2018)	
Plan Vivo Technical Specification for Forestry Plantations for sustainable Wood Production, 2011.	
Plan Vivo Annual Report 2017	
CO2 Scientific Growthmodel 2018/2019	

Supporting documents assessment during the field verification.			
ID	Date of publication	Title	Place, Author
1	Oct-2018	Lista de comité forestales y directórios	Cochabamba, SICIREC

2	Sep-2016	Lista de Actores claves	Cochabamba, SICIREC
3	Jan-2018	Mitigación del cambio climático y medidas de adaptación: Aplicación de mejores prácticas de uso de la tierra por los pequeños agricultores en la amazonía boliviana	Cochabamba, SICIREC
4	Jan-2019	Mitigación del cambio climático y medidas de adaptación: Aplicación de mejores prácticas de uso de la tierra por los pequeños agricultores en la amazonía boliviana	Cochabamba, SICIREC
5	Oct-2018	Reporte General de Monitoreo de Plantaciones	Cochabamba, SICIREC
6	Oct-2018	Formularios 15-A/B/C y D. Parcelas Permanentes de Muestreo (PPM)	Cochabamba, SICIREC
7	Jan-2018	Informe - MITIGACIÓN DEL CAMBIO CLIMÁTICO Y MEDIDAS DE ADAPTACIÓN	Cochabamba, SICIREC
8	Aug-2018	Formularios 15- C : 1/2. Parcelas Permanentes de Muestreo (PPM) – Registro de medición	Cochabamba, SICIREC
9	Aug-2009	Formularios 8- Establecimiento de Sistemas Agroforestales.	Cochabamba, SICIREC
10	Oct-2012	Plan de Monitoreo de Biodiversidad.	Cochabamba, SICIREC
11	Dec-2016 – Oct-2018	Recibos de Pago por servicios de manetención y tala de la PFC	San Carlos, SICIREC
12	Oct-2018	Anexo al Protocolo: Selección de sitios para fines de reforestación: Exclusión de áreas aledañas a corrientes de agua	San Carlos, SICIREC
13	Feb-2017	Contrato Especifico para el establecimiento, Mantenimiento, aprovechamiento y comercialización de plantaciones forestales	San Carlos, SICIREC
14	Aug-2018	Solicitud de certificados de compatibilidad de usos.	Santa Cruz, SICIREC
15	Mar-2017	Comunicación - Contrato Marco y Específico	San Carlos, SICIREC

6. INTINERARY OF THE FIELD VISIT

Assessment during field-visit			
Date	Location	Time spend	Auditor
18-oct-2018	Rurrenabaque (Beni)	8 hours	Flavio Guiera
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Opening Meeting - Planification of field visit - Stakeholders Consultation - Field Visit to Communities: Bajo Colorado, Uncallamaya, San Bernardo, Tica Liñares, Los Tigres, 12 de Juño 			
19-oct-2018	San Buenaventura (La Paz)	8 hours	Flavio Guiera
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Field visit to Communities: 25 de Mayo, Bella Altura 			
20-oct-2018	Rurrenabaque (Beni)	6 hours	Flavio Guiera
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Field visit to member Alberto Castellon Aguilar. Comunidad Carmen Soledad - Stakeholders Consultation 			
21-oct-2018	Puerto Villarroel (Cochabamba)	6 hours	Flavio Guiera
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Field visit to project members, Comunidad Valle Hermoso - Stakeholders Consultation 			
22-Oct-2018	San Carlos (Santa Cruz)	10 hours	Flavio Guiera
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Field visit to Community Tacuarita - Stakeholders Consultation 			
23-Oct-2018	San Carlos /Buena Vista (Ichilo-Santa Cruz)	8 hours	Flavio Guiera
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Stakeholders Consultation - Field visit to Comunidad Salitral y Propiedades privadas. 			
24-Oct-2018	San Carlos (Ichilo-Santa Cruz)	4 hours	Flavio Guiera
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Documentation review at ArBolivia Offices - Closing Meeting 			

7. INTERVIEWS DURING THE FIELD VISIT

Assessment during field-visit			
Date	Person	Time spent	auditor
18 to 24-Oct-2018	Jorge Goitia – Executive Manager ArBolivia	56 hours	Flavio Guiera
18 to 24-Oct-2018	Jose Angel Bailly Arias – Monitoring Coordinator ArBolivia.	56 hours	Flavio Guiera
18-Oct-2018	Marco Antonio –Executive officer of Unidad Forestal Municipal de Rurrenabaque	1 hour	Flavio Guiera
18 to 21-Oct-2018	Moises Andres Acarapi – Regional supervisor Rurrenabaque ArBolivia	30 hours	Flavio Guiera
19 Oct-2018	Marcelo Condori Nina – Plantation Management Technician ArBolivia	6 hours	Flavio Guiera
20-Oct-2018	David Jalacori Mendoza - Plantation Management Technician ArBolivia	6 hours	Flavio Guiera
18-Oct-2018	Freddy Mamani Quiñones - Plantation Management Technician ArBolivia	3 hours	Flavio Guiera
03-Oct-2018	Pablo Hilarion Zuna Ramos – Settler, project member	1 hour	Flavio Guiera
18-Oct-2018	Justo Mtayo Huro – Settler, project member	1 hour	Flavio Guiera
18-Oct-2018	Carmelo Cunay Vasnay– Settler, project member	1 hour	Flavio Guiera
18-Oct-2018	Ruben Luna Limachi– President of Comite Forestal 12 de Junio	2 hours	Flavio Guiera
18-Oct-2018	Josefina Espinoza Ortiz de Camacho - Settler, project member	30 min	Flavio Guiera
19-Oct-2018	Barnabe Patzi Chok – Secretary of Federación Interculturales de Beni	1 h 30 min	Flavio Guiera
19-Oct-2018	Isabel Tarifa Gallardo de Rivero – Settler, project member	30 min	Flavio Guiera
19-Oct-2018	Aurelio Quispe Nina - Plantation Management Technician ArBolivia	3 hours	Flavio Guiera
19-Oct-2018	Juan Garcia Anabamba - Settler, project member	30 min	Flavio Guiera
19-Oct-2018	Abel Cartagena Silva - Settler, project member	1 hour	Flavio Guiera
19-Oct-2018	Isabel Tarifa Gallardo de Rivero - Settler, project member	30 min	Flavio Guiera
19-Oct-2018	Henrry Coaquira Vidaurre - Plantation Management Technician ArBolivia	3 hours	Flavio Guiera

19-Oct-2018	Freddy Juchasara Pillco - Regional supervisor San Carlos ArBolivia	6 hours	Flavio Guiera
20-Oct-2018	Alberto Castellon Aguilar - Settler, project member	1 hour	Flavio Guiera
20-Oct-2018	Jose Luis Ventura Vargas - Regional supervisor Tropic of Cochabamba ArBolivia	4 hours	Flavio Guiera
21-Oct-2018	Gregorio Udaeta Fuentes- Settler, project member	30 min	Flavio Guiera
21-Oct-2018	Natalio Aguilar - Settler, project member	30 min	Flavio Guiera
21-Oct-2018	Humberto Rodrigues Settler, project member	4 hours	Flavio Guiera
22-Oct-2018	Ernesto Uanka – técnico para café y pos cosecha - Instituto Nacional de Innovación Agropecuaria y Forestal (INIAF)	30 min	Flavio Guiera
22-Oct-2018	Nilson lapu – jefe de comercializacion - Instituto Nacional de Innovación Agropecuaria y Forestal (INIAF)	30 min	Flavio Guiera
22-Oct-2018	Osvaldo Navida – Responsable Regional Instituto Nacional de Innovación Agropecuaria y Forestal (INIAF) – Tropico de Cochabamba/Santa Cruz	2 hours	Flavio Guiera
22-Oct-2018	Santos Mamani Romero – Director regional ABT (Autoridad de Fiscalización y Control Social de Bosques y Tierra) – UOBT Santa Fé de Yapacani	2 hours	Flavio Guiera
23-Oct-2018	Carlos Vargas – Plantation Management Technician ArBolivia	1 hour	Flavio Guiera
23-Oct-2018	Cirilo Quispe Tardio - Settler, project member.	1 hour	Flavio Guiera
23-Oct-2018	Sandro Paredes – Settler, project member	30 min	Flavio Guiera

ANNEX 1 CAR'S OVERVIEW

NC: CUC-FAR-01	Reference : 2.3	Category : MINOR		
Date found: 08/10/2016	Deadline for correction: 5 years from closing meeting (23 October 2023)			
<p>Description of indicator: Project interventions must not lead to any negative environmental impacts, e.g. soil erosion or reduction of water quality.</p>				
<p>Description of non-conformity: Despite the fact that ArBolivia Project has managed the waste in an appropriate manner for the sources found at field level, the project manager did not present a written policy or documented procedures which describe all sources of waste and waste products, followed by instructions and measures for the appropriate collection, transport, storage, handling and disposal.</p>				
<p>Evidence received, and analysis of corrections and corrective actions provided for NC closure: NC closure was verified during the actual audit. It is observed that the farmers are more conscious regarding the waste problem and are happy about the diminishing of waste spread at the field. Arbolivia Project is still working on the waste management procedures and policies, as well as the training and education for project members in order to reduce waste production and how to deal with those considered toxic or hazardous for people and environment. Within the region where the project is established no licensed companies are available to manage hazardous waste properly, which therefore creates a challenge for the Project Developer to correctly treat and dispose this kind of material. Generally non toxic or hazardous waste is incinerated at the field.</p>				
<p>Evidence observed still insufficient to close the NC, so NC remains open, with deadline of 23/10/2023.</p>				
<p>Documents reviewed</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mitigación del cambio climático y medidas de adaptación: Aplicación de mejores prácticas de uso de la tierra por los pequeños agricultores en la amazonía boliviana (Enero-2019) - Plan Vivo Annual Report 2017 				
<p>Status: OPEN</p>				

NC: CUC-FAR-02	Reference : 5.3	Category : MINOR
Date found: 24/10/2018	Deadline for correction: 5 years from closing meeting (23 October 2023)	

Description of indicator: Technical specifications must be updated at least every 5 years where they are still being used to sign new PES Agreements, by reviewing both available data from project monitoring results, e.g. species growth data, and new available data from outside the project

Description of non-conformity:

Project developer did not review the documents such as “Manuales de campo socioeconómico y biodiversidad”, “Sistema de monitoreo y evaluación del proyecto Arbolivia”, in agreement with the findings of annual reports and updated information that are being implemented at field level like calliper use for measurements, buffer zones protocol, health and safety at thinning, waste management and species growth model, for example.

Evidence received, and analysis of corrections and corrective actions provided for NC closure:

Documents reviewed

Status: OPEN

OBS: CUC-OBS-01	Reference : 2.4.2	Category : OBSERVATION
Date found: 08/10/2016	Deadline for correction: N/A	
<p>Description of indicator:</p> <p>2.4. Any trees planted to generate ecosystem services must be native or naturalised species, and must not be invasive. Naturalised species must only be planted if:</p> <p>2.4.1 There are livelihood benefits that make the use of the species preferable to any alternative native species; AND</p> <p>2.4.2 Use of the species will not have a negative impact on biodiversity or the provision of key ecosystem services in the project and surrounding areas.</p>		
<p>Description of non-conformity:</p> <p>Project Manager should present a more detailed guidance to the establishment of trees plantation on the board with buffer zones, considering to avoid risks of having commercial plantations in fragile or key protection zones along the management cycle. Also, the project manager should clearly demonstrate in maps (not only by croquis) all riparian and hydrographic elements herein mentioned as “water bodies” and their buffer zones established or planned to be reformed in it.</p>		
<p>Evidence received, and analysis of corrections and corrective actions provided for OBS closure:</p> <p>ArBolivia released an annex to the protocol of site selection (Anexo al Protocolo: Selección de sitios para fines de reforestación: Exclusión de áreas aledañas a corrientes de agua) which clearly states that buffer zones in a limit of 15 m from water streams cannot be considered as productive areas nor being forested with exotic species, such as required by the standard.</p>		
<p>Documents reviewed</p> <p>Anexo al Protocolo: Selección de sitios para fines de reforestación: Exclusión de áreas aledañas a corrientes de agua</p>		
<p>Status: CLOSED</p>		

OBS: CUC-OBS-02	Reference : 3.14	Category : OBSERVATION
Date found: 08/10/2016	Deadline for correction: N/A	
Description of indicator: 3.14 Where participants or other community members are given employment opportunities through the project, the project coordinator must identify relevant laws and regulations covering workers' rights in the host country and ensure the employment arrangements meet or exceed those requirements.		
Description of non-conformity: The project coordinator should make available the copies of 8 Fundamental ILO Conventions for workers.		
Evidence received, and analysis of corrections and corrective actions provided for OBS closure: Project Coordinator made available hard and soft copies of all 8 Fundamental Principles of work of ILO to the regional offices (Ichilo, Concepción y Cochabamba). A formal communication was issued by the central office and signed by the coordinators in charge of transmission and by the regional coordinator to all workers of respective zones.		
Documents reviewed Reply for the CARs and OBSCI-PER_17/16 (21st December 2016) - Envió y Constancia de recepción y conocimiento del documento sobre "Los Convenios Fundamentales OIT" – A todo el personal – Oficina Administrativa y oficinas de campo – Concepción (with signatures of receipt of local Coordinators)- CI-PER_17/16 (21st December 2016) - Envió y Constancia de recepción y conocimiento del documento sobre "Los Convenios Fundamentales OIT" – A todo el personal – Oficina Administrativa y oficinas de campo – Ichilo (with signatures of receipt of local Coordinators) CI-PER_17/16 (21st December 2016) - Envió y Constancia de recepción y conocimiento del documento sobre "Los Convenios Fundamentales OIT" – A todo el personal – Oficina Administrativa y oficinas de campo – TC (with signatures of receipt of local coordinators)		
Status: CLOSED		

OBS: CUC-OBS-03	Reference : 5.18	Category : OBSERVATION
Date found: 08/10/2016	Deadline for correction: N/A	
Description of indicator: An approved approach must be used to quantify initial carbon stocks and emissions sources, and estimate how they are most likely to change over the project period, as part of the baseline scenario.		
Description of non-conformity: ArBolivia has correctly applied the given carbon pools for each parameter of calculation (UNFCCC/ AM-ARS0001 vs.5.) both for root-to-shoot ratio and wood density, as part of the		

calculations to determine carbon stocks concerning each of the baseline scenarios as described in the PDD.

Based on the monitoring results within the Permanent Sample Plots-PSPs, the Project Developer was able to gather and demonstrate to the Control Union auditor sufficient data to establish growth models for each of the planted species. These accurate data are being used to update values as appropriate of the baseline scenarios for each intervention projected in the Program Developer's Plan of Activities (PoA).

Despite the developments to quantify carbon stocks, Arbolivia Project carbon pool is still based on values of Root-to-Shoot and Wood Density from default values sourced by UNFCCC/AM-ARS0001 vs.5.

Given that the Plan of Activities is already in the phase of thinning intervention of some of the planted species, it should be an opportunity to apply the calculation approach for Root:Shoot and Wood-density.

OBSERVATION: Project manager should implement analysis of samples of first soil horizons to improve conversion factors (e.g. Root:Shoot) of planted sites concerning its species and management. Also, the Project manager should implement analysis of wood density once thinning is taking place, to complement the bibliographic data.

Evidence received, and analysis of corrections and corrective actions provided for OBS closure:

*On 16th Jan, 2017 - Arbolivia Project sent documents with evidences for closing CARs raised during the verification audit (08th Oct-2016). Concerning CUC-OBS-03 the answer was: "Sicirec Bolivia va a incluir estos sugerencias en el plan de monitoreo y esperamos de poder implementar este en el segundo semestre de 2017, con el apoyo de la facultad de ciencias forestales de la Universidad Autonoma René Gabriel Moreno (UAGRM) de Santa Cruz. Sicirec Bolivia tiene un convenio con la carrera forestal de la UAGRM, la UAGRM tiene un laboratorio funcionando. En reunión sostenido con el director de la Carrera Forestal (Dr. Eduardo Sandoval) y Gerencia general y gerencia técnica de Sicirec el 21 de diciembre, se ha acordado que a partir de medianos de 2017 se estaría realizando este trabajo con uno o mas tesistas." - De acuerdo, se va a fortalecer la implementación del plan de monitoreo, lo cual en realidad define estos aspectos, mediante capacitación de los responsables a cargo del trabajo de campo." (original Spanish document)

"Sicirec Bolivia will include these findings (OBS) in its Monitoring Plan and hopefully this can be implemented during the second semester of 2017 with the help of „Facultad de Ciencias Forestales de la Universidad Autonoma René Gabriel Moreno (UAGRM) de Santa Cruz“. Sicirec Bolivia has an agreement with the Forestry department of the UAGRM, which has a permanently functioning laboratory. In a meeting held on 21st of December between the Forestry Department (Dr. Eduardo Sandoval) and Sicirec's general manager and technical manager, it has been agreed that starting in mid-2017, this work would be done with one or more thesis students. Accordingly, the implementation of the monitoring plan will be strengthened, which actually defines these aspects, through training of those responsible for field work". (free ENG translation)

OBS closure was verified during the actual audit (24th-Oct,2018).

No further actions by the Project Developer could be evidenced to address the closure of this Observation.

Evidence observed still insufficient to close the OBS, so it remains OPEN.

Documents reviewed

Reply for the CARs and OBS – 17th-Jan,2017

Sistema de Monitoreo y Evaluación del Proyecto ArBolivia – Reporte General (24th Oct,2018)

Status: OPEN

OBS: CUC-OBS-04

Reference : 5.2

Category : OBSERVATION

Date found: 24/10/2018

Deadline for correction: N/A

Description of indicator: Sources of data used to quantify ecosystem services, including all assumptions and default factors, must be specified and as up-to-date as possible, with a justification for why they are appropriate.

Description of non-conformity:

Arbolia Project has implemented a new method of taking measures of trees in the Permanent Sample Plots, with the use of callipers. Although it has been considered a more productive device, it was identified that only 1 measure has been taken at the DBH. It is also identified that species like Teak show a considerable distortion in a cross measurement, due to the irregular form of the stem. Project Manager should implement standard operational procedures and appropriate forms to take data and for the use of callipers in the monitoring of trees' growth.

The fieldcheck of trees measured during the latest round of PPS' monitoring did not show significant mismatches between data, but it's an important point of attention for the accuracy of monitoring plan.

Evidence received, and analysis of corrections and corrective actions provided for OBS closure:
Documents reviewed
Status: OPEN